

**Ministry of Climate Change and Natural Disaster (Department of Energy)  
and  
United Nations Development Programme**

**Barrier Removal for Achieving the National Energy Road Map Targets of Vanuatu  
(BRANTV) – Local Project Appraisal Committee (LPAC) Meeting, 26<sup>th</sup> July 2018**

**Minutes**

---

*Date:* 26<sup>th</sup> July 2018

*Venue:* Department of Environment Conference Room, Vila, Vanuatu

*Chaired by:* Mr. David Gibson, Acting Director, Department of Energy, Ministry of Climate Change and Natural Disaster

*Time:* 9:30am to 1:00pm

Present:

1. Mr. David Gibson, Acting Director, Department of Energy, Ministry of Climate Change and Natural Disaster. Email: [dgibson@vanuatu.gov.vu](mailto:dgibson@vanuatu.gov.vu), [dgibson@meteo.gov.vu](mailto:dgibson@meteo.gov.vu)
2. Mr. John Obed Ailee, Chief Executive Officer, Utility Regulatory Authority (URA), Vanuatu. Email: [joailee@ura.gov.vu](mailto:joailee@ura.gov.vu)
3. Mrs. Viviane Obed, Team Leader – SGP/Mama. Email: [gm@furtherarts.org](mailto:gm@furtherarts.org)
4. Ms. Roselyn Bue, Ozone and Chemical Senior Officer. Email: [rbue@vanuatu.gov.vu](mailto:rbue@vanuatu.gov.vu)
5. Mr. Paul Kaun, Senior Programme Officer, Global Green Growth Institute (GGGI). Email: [paul.kaun@gggi.org](mailto:paul.kaun@gggi.org)
6. Mr. Johnely Jerette, UN Desk Officer, Department of Foreign Affairs. Email: [jjerette@vanuatu.gov.vu](mailto:jjerette@vanuatu.gov.vu)
7. Mr. Reedly Alfred Tari, Director, Department of Environment, Protection and Conservation, (DEPC). Email: [ratari@vanuatu.gov.vu](mailto:ratari@vanuatu.gov.vu)
8. Ms. Leah Nimoho, National Coordinator, GEF Small Grants Programme, UNDP, Vanuatu. Email: [NimohoL@unops.org](mailto:NimohoL@unops.org)
9. Ms. Mahina Sherryl, Programme Assistant, GEF Small Grants Programme, UNDP, Vanuatu. Email: [MahinaS@unops.org](mailto:MahinaS@unops.org)
10. Mr. Joseph Temakon, Principal Scientific Officer - Energy Efficiency, Department of Energy, [jtemakon@vanuatu.gov.vu](mailto:jtemakon@vanuatu.gov.vu)
11. Mr. Thomas Jensen, Energy Programme Specialist, Resilience & Sustainable Development Unit, UNDP Pacific Office in Fiji. Email: [thomas.jensen@undp.org](mailto:thomas.jensen@undp.org)
12. Mr. Donald Woulouseje, Programme Analyst, Integrated Results Management Unit (IRMU)-Vanuatu, UNDP Pacific Office in Fiji. Email: [donald.woulouseje@undp.org](mailto:donald.woulouseje@undp.org)
13. Ms. Emma Mario, Programme Analyst, Resilience & Sustainable Development Unit, UNDP Pacific Office in Fiji. Email: [emma.mario@undp.org](mailto:emma.mario@undp.org)

**Agenda**

The agenda for the LPAC was discussed and agreed collectively between the Department of Energy and UNDP. This is attached as Annex 1.

## **Discussions on the approved UNDP/GEF BRANTV project document**

### *Governance and Management Arrangements*

- The Project Board (steering committee) should be considered an input towards a needed whole-of-Government approach towards meeting the targets of Vanuatu's National Energy Road Map. Additional existing or planned national energy sector governance mechanisms could also assist improving the coordination of sustainable energy initiatives supported by donors and development partners through information management and knowledge sharing. The project organization structure should assist enabling the coordination of national efforts and will make the work of key sector stakeholders easier, e.g. in terms of developing and agreeing to national standards for specific renewable energy and energy efficiency technologies that will be demonstrated through BRANTV. Vanuatu recognizes that a lot of goodwill and aid are accessible to Vanuatu, which need to be well-coordinated and made available to key stakeholders.
- There is need to streamline the Project Board composition and reduce the number of members to feature representatives from UNDP (as Senior Supplier), the Ministry of Climate Change and Natural Disasters (as the Executive), and the Ministry of Internal Affairs (as Senior Beneficiary).
- A Technical Working Group (TWG) could be introduced to support the Project Management Unit (PMU) in managing the technical components of BRANTV and provide technical advice to the Project Board. It should be considered using existing relevant technical working group(s), e.g. established as part of VREP.
- In addition to relevant technical government line ministries, key private sector groups could also form part of the TWG. The Vanuatu Chamber of Commerce could be a representative of the private sector. A representative from the banking sector and the Department of Women could also be part of the TWG.

### *Technical Components*

- The engagement of private sector and financial institutions into key specific activities of the project will revolved around operational matters, where they can bring in the "know how" technology, innovation into the whole project implementation phase. However, they are expected to have no or very limited role in the decision-making process (due to a potential conflict of interest), instead the government will be taking lead role with the key stakeholders.
- Currently, there are no funds available for sustaining the operational and maintenance costs of solar systems in rural communities. The financing mechanism that will be supported by BRANTV will assist addressing this issue including the recently established National Green Energy Fund (NGEF).
- Financial institutions can also be considered during the implementation phase on identifying a suitable model of community-based management of the systems that is workable to suit the social context while keeping the balance of business as usual operations to ensure sustainability over time.
- Regarding the scope and distribution of BRANTV demonstration sites, while the mini and pico hydro projects are specific to sites that have freshwater resources (site

specific), the solar PV projects and energy efficiency cookstoves have a wider scope and will be distributed to all sites.

- The NGEF could be considered to backstop operational and maintenance costs of community-based demonstration projects.
- Suppliers of solar systems and lighting in Vanuatu do not always have spare parts readily available. E.g. in context of the ‘Solar Mamas’ supported by the GEF Small Grants Programme on several occasions, parts had to be ordered from India – the delays meant that households had to go without electricity.
- Some projects do introduce new technologies that are usually not sold in Vanuatu prior to the project commencement. While such projects have good intentions, once the project stops these technologies will no longer be available. This project needs to ensure that after the project lapses, spare parts or replacements of the chosen technologies are available in the local market.
- Community based project management always fails in Vanuatu, a good example in the water supply project. Component 3 of the BRANTV project will address this issue.
- The concept of productive uses of renewable energy - income-generation activities - need to be carefully thought through prior to and during project implementation. E.g. secure market access via regular and affordable transportation from outer islands to urban or overseas markets and a multi-sector approach are key to sustaining income-generating activities.

### *Gender Analysis*

- A key focus of BRANTV is to support indigenous groups in outer island rural communities access clean energy. The activities need to be designed to specifically address the differentiated gender needs of communities. While the micro-credit scheme that was established through Vanuatu Women’s Development Scheme (Vanwods) enabled women to purchase solar-powered lights, the lights become not only obsolete after five years but it also has limitations in terms of productive use of energy. Furthermore, communities do not have access to technicians who are readily available to provide repair and maintenance services when required.
- So far, a total of four ni-Vanuatu women have received training in solar engineering at Barefoot College in India through the Solar Mama Programme supported through GEF Small Grants Programme. Since coming back these women have trained family members in their communities and so far solar photovoltaic systems have been installed in 112 households. An additional around 350 systems in seven villages planned also supported by GEF Small Grants Programme. The standard solar system package of 40Wp has the capacity to power four lights and charge mobile phones in a household. The community-based enterprise is managed by women and headed by men. The solar mamas have experienced several major challenges including not receiving payment for the services provided. The issues have been escalated to the local government.
- BRANTV could build on and support the work of the Solar Mama Programme particularly the suppliers of solar spare parts. BRANTV could facilitate the adjustments of the NERM to include the inclusive growth that has been demonstrated through the Solar Mamas Programme. Local networks for the Solar Mamas

Programme already exists, which BRANTV could use and enhance. BRANTV could organize a forum for solar equipment suppliers that could involve the civil society and women solar engineers.

- Proposed measures for Gender Equality and Women’s Empowerment through BRANTV are reasonable however the specific gender targets should be relooked at vis-à-vis if they realistically can be achieved. An ongoing project in Tanna involves women as managers of processing copra and virgin oil.
- Governance at the community level that considers gender sensitivities is currently lacking in Vanuatu. It is important to assist addressing this issue so that BRANTV demonstration projects are not faced with significant operational issues that will stall implementation. For instance, men could be included as gender champions.
- Currently, the overall perception is that solar engineering and technician work is a man’s field. Communities are not supportive of the Solar Mamas and are reluctant to receive training from them. Solar MaMas had to train family members who are now assisting them. In the aftermath of Tropical Cyclone Pam in 2015, Epau was the first community to receive electricity the day after the cyclone hit due to the efficient services provided by the Solar Mamas.
- Once BRANTV is formally endorsed and signed off, the Inception Workshop could look at relevant ongoing and planned projects and efforts on women’s empowerment and share good practices that BRANTV could build upon. One such example is the Markets For Change Project that works towards the empowerment of women in playing their role as market vendors.

#### *Social and Environmental Screening*

- The level of significance of the potential social and environmental risks of BRANTV is considered ‘moderate’. This requires that an Environmental & Social Management Plan (ESMP) is developed as soon as the project implementation starts and is a pre-requisite to commencing the demonstration projects.
- One of the risks identified is ‘natural disasters’, which are frequent in Vanuatu with potential to destroy installed off-grid renewable energy power system demonstrations of the project. The risk will be assessed during the Environmental and Social Impact Assessment and captured in the ESMP as determined appropriate. In this case, attention needs to be made to allocating budgets (from either BRANTV, the Government, and/or the NGEF, etc.) to support ‘building back better’ efforts after natural disasters occur. Furthermore, disaster-proofing needs to be included in the design and component specification of off-grid renewable energy power system demonstration projects.

#### *Quality Assurance Assessment*

The first quality assurance assessment was carried out for the design phase of BRANTV. While the overall rating was satisfactory, areas that require improvement and clarification are as follows:

- Gender analysis – based on the gender survey that was conducted in December 2017, the gender analysis needs to be completed. This will inform the development of BRANTV’s Gender Strategy and Action Plan.



- Engagement of key stakeholders – an analysis is required on the role of other partners in the areas (including geographical) where the project intends to work. The analysis needs to identify how the results achieved by relevant partners will contribute to outcome-level change complementing the project’s results. This could be undertaken during project inception and implementation.
- Social and Environmental Standards – as mentioned above given the ‘moderate’ risk rating of BRANTV, the EMIA needs to be conducted and an ESMP developed and implemented. This is already part of the project activities and will be undertaken at the start of project implementation.
- Governance mechanism – the project’s governance mechanism needs to be elaborated including individuals identified for each position. Importantly, Project Board members need to agree on their roles and responsibilities as specified in the terms of reference.
- Implementation modality – even though the 2015 HACT micro-assessment of the implementing partner (i.e. the Ministry of Climate Change and Natural Disasters) for a different project is still valid, options for implementation modalities have not been thoroughly considered. There needs to be strong justification for choosing the selected modality, based on the development context. This needs to be mentioned in the relevant annex of the project document.

*Comments from UNDP’s internal pre-PAC process*

The pre-PAC took place during the week of 9<sup>th</sup> to 13<sup>th</sup> July 2018. Most comments received are editorial and in-line with the UNDP programming standards and do not require a significant modification to the project. The main comments are as follows:

- Include a narrative on the theory of change.
- Include activities that address specific gender needs that were identified during the gender survey in December 2017.
- Include indicators in the project results framework to track solid community participation and gender equity as well as clarify some of the output level indicators.
- Streamlining the Project Board composition and include a TWG.

**Follow-up actions**

The LPAC agrees that the following actions would be addressed either before signing the BRANTV project document or during the inception phase of the project:

- Governance mechanism – elaborate the project’s governance mechanism including individuals identified for each position. In addition, Project board members agree to their roles and responsibilities as specified in the terms of reference. [This will be led by DoE and supported by UNDP during project inception phase.]
- Implementation modality – elaborate the justification for choosing the selected NIM modality. [This will be facilitated by UNDP during project inception phase.]
- Gender analysis – complete by end of September 2018 and include activities that address specific gender needs identified. [This will be led by UNDP and supported by DoE before the signing of project document.]

- Include a narrative of the theory of change (in the situation analysis section of the project document). [This will be led by UNDP and supported by DoE before the signing of project document.]
- Include indicators in the project results framework to track community participation and gender equity and revise some of the output level indicators so they can be operationalized. [This will be led by UNDP and supported by DoE before the signing of project document.]

**Recommendation**

- The proposed project be approved on a no-objection basis.
- That minor editorial changes are to be made to the project document prior to sign-off.

**Signature of LPAC Chair**



.....  
Mr. David Gibson,  
Acting Director,  
Department of Energy,  
Ministry of Climate Change and Natural Disasters.

Date: ..... 29/08/2018 .....

## Annex 1 – LPAC Agenda

Thursday, 26 July 2018	
8:30 am – 9:00 am	Registration
9:00 am – 9:10 am	Welcome remarks by the LPAC Chair – David Gibson, Acting Director, Department of Energy
9:10 am – 9:15 am	Introduction of participants (facilitated by the Chair, David Gibson)
9:15 am – 9:40am	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Overview of UNDP Project Cycle, and What has been produced during the Project Preparation Grant? - Thomas Jensen (UNDP)</li> </ul> <p>Background information – Joseph Temakon (DoE)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Energy situation in Vanuatu (demand, supply, status, gaps, etc)</li> <li>• Overview of BRANTV project (total budget, financiers, implementing partners and agencies, beneficiaries, timeframe;</li> <li>• Technical overview of BRANTV project: what are the issues that the project intends to address, what are the specific interventions, what are the expected results, and what solutions will be developed to help meet long-term energy demand;</li> <li>• Project Structure and Institutional Arrangements;</li> <li>• Management &amp; Coordination Arrangements; and</li> <li>• Total budget and workplan.</li> </ul>
9:40 am – 9:55 am	Refreshment
9:55 am – 10:20 am	<p>Gender Analysis, Social &amp; Environmental Screening, Quality Assurance Assessment checklist, UNDP Pre-PAC Meeting findings and recommendations.</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">- Emma Mario (UNDP)</p>
10:20am – 1:00pm	Discussions on the project document, LPAC recommendation, Closing of LPAC
1:00 pm – 2:00 pm	Lunch